



Clatto Landscape Protection Group

Email clpg@tesco.net Phone 07890 156 680

www.clatto.org.uk

IMPACT ON THE LOCAL AREA

The Scale of the Proposal

It is widely acknowledged that the landscape in which the proposal would sit is an intimate, interesting and attractive landscape. This is felt by many in the local community as well being echoed in SNH's landscape Character Assessment and the Council's designation of the area as one of great landscape value.

The turbines would be present in a number and at a height which would be grossly out of scale with their landscape setting and be seen by those living close to the site as well as many Fifers living and working in Central Fife and its visitors.

Clatto Hill is 248 metres above sea level. Trees on and near this hill are never more than 18 metres tall, a sixth of the 93 metre height of the proposed turbines to blade tip.

The setting is one of mainly gently flowing slopes, with no dramatic changes in elevation. The landscape contains no features, natural or made-made, which compare in height or number to the proposed turbines. The nearby electricity pylons are about a third of the proposed turbine height.

The turbines would be very prominent features on the skyline from many viewpoints. There exists no "backclothing" or other means to reduce the perception of scale.

There is very little which exists anywhere in Fife on this scale and nothing at all in such a prominent location. The Hopetoun Monument is very prominent in Central Fife. It appears large to the casual viewer, even from a distance of several miles. This is only 29 metres tall, compared to the turbines 93 metres, and there are 17 of them.

Nothing in the design of the proposal mitigates the impact to any meaningful extent.

The Amenity of Nearest Residents

Several members of CLPG have visited the turbines on Deucheran Hill, two of which are 93 metres tall. We have considered the impact of turbines of such a height as close as they are proposed to the nearest residents. Seven homes lie within half a mile of the turbine site. Our conclusion from this visit is that the turbines would have a constant overbearing and extremely dominant presence, greatly detrimental to the amenity of the nearby residents, who will see some or all

of the turbines. The fact that the turbines move when generating will just exacerbate this effect.

For the nearest residents, the top of Clatto Hill is about 60 metres higher than their dwellings. The turbines reach one and a half times this again skywards! By no stretch of the imagination can this amount to the turbines being “accommodated” into the environment.

While it is claimed in Scottish Power’s Environmental Impact Assessment that noise from the turbines will be within the guidance set for this, those guidelines do not adequately recognise

- a) how quiet an area the environs of Clatto Hill currently are, most of the time, and
- b) that people normally sleep with bedroom windows open for good health reasons and will hear the relentless beating sounds emitted.

The nearest residents will experience infrasound, which may have detrimental health effects. See Appendix 3.

For the cottages on Clatto Hill, the view from their main habitable rooms is south and south west, exactly where the turbines are proposed to be sited.

For the Devon cottages, they suffer from being closest at only 600 metres away, with sight of all of the turbines.

The prominence of the Turbines for people Living Within 3 Kilometres of the proposed Development

The following settlements are situated within **3 kilometres** of the proposed development:

Kettlehill	Coaltown of Burnturk	Burnturk
Brotus	Priestfield	Lower Bunzion
Upper Bunzion	Cults Farm	Downfield
Skelpie	Paradise	Muirhead
Clatto	Montrave	Clatto Barns
Praytis	Foggieleys	Smithygreen
Kilmux	Letham Feus	Letham
Balgrummo	Wester Durie	Drummaird
Bonnybank	Baintown	Gallowhill
North Kennoway	Auchtermairnie Farm	Langside
Lalathan Farm	Balinkirk	Langdyke
Milldeans	Devon	Rameldry
Middlefield	Muirend Smithfield	Newhall

This represents a population of about 6,000.

In CLPG’s view, it is unreasonable for residents in all of those locations to have to live as close as this to such a visually intrusive development. Whether the view out of their windows, from their gardens, while walking close to home, leaving

home or arriving home, there would be no escape from the relentless intrusion of the moving turbines.

A dangerous precedent would be set for Fife, were this development to be allowed to proceed. It would become difficult for the Council to refuse other applications, which intruded into the amenity of other Fife residents to a similar degree.

Prominence Across Much of Central Fife

This development would be seen and be an imposing presence in almost all of the surrounding area. It would also be prominent from high ground round Fife including from the Lomonds, Largo Law, Hill of Tarvit, and the eastern end of the Ochils.

One straightforward means of gauging the visual impact of wind turbines is the Sinclair-Thomas Matrix. This was drawn up after extensive experience by a planner and an environmental consultant. This matrix has been criticised for lack of sensitivity to landscape factors relevant at some distance. It seems to us relevant to those who would have to live in close proximity to a windfarm.

According to the Sinclair-Thomas Matrix, turbines between 90 and 100 metres high would have a “dominant impact” up to 4 kilometres from their site, due to the “large scale, movement, proximity and number.” This is the severest grading in the matrix. There are **EIGHT villages** within 4 kilometres of the proposed development, as well as many other very small settlements, mainly groupings of cottages on farms. The same Matrix describes an impact to 8 kilometres as “major” due to “proximity capable of dominating the landscape”. The following **SIXTEEN villages and small towns** lie within 8 kilometres of the proposed development:

Ladybank	Windygates
Markinch	Star
Leven	Kettlebridge
Methil	Balmalcolm
Buckhaven	Pitlessie
Lower Largo	Freuchie
Upper Largo	Craigrothie
Kennoway	Ceres

Spoiling a Popular Area for Peaceful Recreation

The proposed site of the windfarm is a popular location for quiet recreation. In addition to being frequently visited by people walking dogs or riding horses, many people walk there because of the tranquillity and quality of landscape and views westwards, south across the Forth and east wards. The area is conveniently accessible for people for many kilometres around.

Turbines in this landscape would spoil views out of the area towards the Lomonds and the Howe of Fife as well as towards the Isle of May. These views are afforded by the elevated position of the area. The valley between Kilmux woods,

Colliston Hill and the disused Wester Kilmux farm steading is an especially intimate and beautiful place, which would be completely ruined by the presence of turbines and the largest of the proposed “borrow pits”. That proposed “borrow pit” adjacent to Wester Kilmux, if used for the extraction of stone, would create a particularly ugly scar in the area.

It is acknowledged that after completion, Scottish Power proposes that there would still be access to the area. While this is true, our point is that the attributes, which make it an attractive place to visit at present, would be destroyed. It would no longer be quiet; it would no longer be a place for quiet reflection. There are no similar areas to this one easily accessible to the public, with the same qualities, in this part of Fife.